RANIERO GNOLI

332 45

Miscellanea Indica

4. CORRECTIONS AND EMENDATIONS TO THE TEXT OF THE PARĀTRIṂŚIKĀVIVARAṆA

From "EAST AND WEST" (New Series, Vol. 10 - No. 3 - September 1959)
IsMEO, Via Merulana 248, ROME

RANIERO GNOLI

Miscellanea Indica

4. CORRECTIONS AND EMENDATIONS TO THE TEXT OF THE PARĀTRIMŚIKĀVIVARAṆA

From "EAST AND WEST" (New Series, Vol. 10 - No. 3 - September 1959)
IsMEO, Via Merulana 248, ROME

Miscellanea Indica

CONTENTS

4. CORRECTIONS AND EMENDATIONS TO THE TEXT OF THE PARĀTRIMŚIKĀVIVARAṆA

The *Parātriṃśikāvivaraṇa* is one of the earliest works by Abhinavagupta that have come down to us. As its title indicates, this work is a commentary and the text it deals with is a brief *tantra*, which, according to the tradition, is a part of the *Rudrayāmala*. The fortune of the thirty-five and a half *śloka*-s composing this *tantra*, one of the most important of the sacred texts on which the Trika school is founded, has been very notable and apart from this commentary by Abhinavagupta they were studied before him by the founder of his *διαδοχή*, Somānanda, the author of the *Śivadṛṣṭi*. In the course of his commentary Abhinavagupta often quotes and discusses passages and interpretations made by Somānanda. Other commentators of this work prior to Abhinavagupta were, as he tells us in his Tantrāloka (Vol. VII, p. 96), Kalyāṇa and Bhavabhūti. Of these writers and of their exegesis we know nothing. These commentaries were not the only ones. Abhinavagupta refers on page 96 of his commentary to other exegetical works which, it seems, departed from the tradition accepted by him and by his spiritual line and which he confutes. The *vivaraṇa* is not the only work Abhinavagupta has written on the *Parātriṃśikā*, but, aware perhaps of the very difficult nature and complexity of that commentary, he wrote later on another shorter one, known as the *Parātriṃśikālaghuvṛtti*, or by the other title of *Anuttaratattvavimarśinī*. Passages from this commentary are frequently quoted by Maheśvarānanda in his *Mahārthamañjarī*. Nor was there any lack of other works of exegesis following that of Abhinavagupta on the *Parātriṃśikā*. Among these I will mention the short commentary by Somānanda (not to be confused with the writer of the same name who was the master of Utpaladeva and also the author, as we have seen, of a commentary on this work), a śaiva of uncertain date, which is really only a versification of Abhinavagupta's *Laghuvṛtti*, and that by Lakṣmīrāma alias Lasakāka (first half of the 18th century) which is but a rather elementary epitome of the *vivaraṇa* of Abhinavagupta.

Not only is Abhinavagupta's commentary on the *Parātriṃśikā* one of the most difficult and complex works by this writer, but the intrinsic difficulty of the text is further complicated by the poor quality of the only edition there is of it, an edition whose negative qualities distinguish it from the other generally good ones of the Kashmir Series of Texts and Studies. When some time ago I undertook to read this work I perceived at once that while some of these difficulties could be solved by an intensive scrutiny of the text, comparing it with the other extant works of Abhinavagupta, in the case of others the help of new manuscripts was required, which I found in the MS of this work preserved in the India Office (1). The notes I now offer are the result of the careful reading of this work and of the comparison with this new manuscript, whose readings I have been gradually annotating on the margins of the copy in my possession.

The only edition of this work is, therefore, that of the KSTS published in 1918 under the editorship of Mukunda Rāma Shāstrī. The manuscripts on which it is based are three. They are written in Shāradā script and date back to the first half of the 19th century. The publisher of this work has indexed them under the letters K, KH, and G. I see no mention in the introduction of a fourth manuscript entered in the critical index under the letter GH. The manuscript collated by me, also of fairly recent date, is written in Devanāgarī, and I am referring to it in the course of these notes under the letter A. A sixth manuscript, that in spite of all my efforts I have not been able to consult, is preserved in the Bhandarkar Institute at Poona (2). All the manuscripts mentioned, however while they are not properly speaking incorrect, and are belong-

(1) *Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of the India Office*, No. 2526 (Foll. 78; size 10 in. by 4 1/2 in.; fair Devanāgarī writing of about 1750 A.D. Nine lines in a page).

(2) G. Bühler, *Detailed Report of a tour in search of Sanskrit manuscripts made in Kashmir, Rajaputana and Central India*, Bombay 1887, No. 460.

ing substantially to a single tradition, are not free from errors, mostly due to the abstruse nature of the work itself of which copies continued to be made, doubtless, more out of respect for the name of the author than with a view to reading and understanding them. Unlike other works by Abhinavagupta, frequently quoted in later śaiva literature, the only author who quotes a passage of this work, as far as I remember, is a late commentator of the *Vijñānabhairava*, Śivopādhyāya, who on page 60 of his commentary quotes a passage of this work taken from page 51, ll. 7-10.

While with the help of the manuscripts at our disposal the correct reading of the text can almost always be reestablished, in some cases in which the manuscript tradition is uniformly corrupt we can be guided only by the meaning and of course by the comparison with other works of Abhinavagupta. Notwithstanding all the care I have devoted to the pages of this work, there are some points on which doubts still exist. Among these I would call the attention of the reader to pages 155-159 whose meaning, in many points — perhaps because the text is sometimes corrupt, — I confess I have been unable fully to grasp. In other passages the meaning requires that the text be corrected. Thus, on page 70, the sense requires that the negative particle *na* preceding *varṇān*, be deleted, and that *kalakalasyaivābhāvāt* be read instead of *kalakalasyaiva bhāvāt*, a change confirmed moreover by KH. Another obvious correction on p. 135 is the change of *mā pratiṣṭhabhāvarāśir* into *mā prathiṣṭha* (aor. from *prath*) *bhāvarāśir*. Similarly, a few lines before, on p. 134, the reading *sṛṣṭau* can be readily derived from the correct one, i. e., *dṛṣṭau*. It is indeed easy in the Śāradā script to mistake *sṛ* for *dṛ*. An inverse exemple of a like phenomenon occurs, for instance, in the *Tantrasāra*, p. 140, l. 4, where we should read *sṛṣṭi* instead of *dṛṣṭi*. Likewise I feel no doubt about the correction of *avasthānena* on p. 167, l. 8, which in this context is quite nonsensical, into *avastyānena*, a word which, though it is not entered in the dictionaries at my disposal, is nevertheless of quite regular formation. Lastly, on p. 222, the meaning requires that we read *na tarhi*, or perhaps *na hi*, instead of the simple *tarhi*. As he runs over these notes the reader will find many other corrections which he will judge for himself. Among the most enigmatic pages of this work have long been the numbers 151-54. Here again I have been able to make them out by drawing up a table of the concordances of the three orders in which the phonems are disposed in the planes of the *parā vāc*, *paśyantī* and *madhyamā*. Not only does this concordance allow of restoring the text, which in all the manuscripts is corrupt, to its correct form, but it also shows how little this work has been studied and understood.

Until such time as further manuscripts may be become available, it is a more difficult matter to correct the few but highly corrupt passages in Prakṛt. In their case, to avoid doing an incomplete and imperfect work, I have as a rule abstained from making corrections. Of the works by Abhinavagupta which have come down to us containing passages in Prakṛt (in most cases *saṃgrahaśloka*) the only one to my knowledge, is this and the *Tantrasāra*. Should I have access to new manuscripts, I shall make these passages the subject of a future study.

Special attention has been paid to the punctuation, which in the manuscripts and in the published text is in most cases misleading. Whenever the commas given in the published text correspond to a *daṇḍa* of MS. A I have kept them as they stand. Whenever the punctuation of the published text seems to me mistaken, I have not hesitated to correct it.

The commentary on the *Parātriṃśikā* contains many quotations. Whenever I have succeeded in tracing out source their, I have always given it.

I do not think the attention I have devoted to this text has been a waste of time. The *Parātriṃśikāvivaraṇa* is one of the most original and fascinating works from the pen of the great śaiva philosopher and some of the pages are perhaps among the most beautiful written in the philosophy of India. The language used is also most noteworthy. Without departing from the Sanskrit of philosophy, of which it is indeed an admirable example, it is handled by Abhinavagupta with more freedom and fluency than in his other works, more closely tied to traditional schemes of composition. Long and elaborate compound words (of more than 40 words) alternate with sentences which have the elegance and the density of a *sūtra*. Daring and sometimes even irregular expressions which can be found here and there seem to me not due to negligence but rather bearing witness to the vitality of the sanskrit language as used in the cultured circles of mediaeval Kashmir. Such, for instance, is the sentence (p. 170-171) *tatrāpi tv anuttarānandecche-śanonmeṣaṇonatvanimeṣāṇāṃ svarūpavimarśe teṣāṃ vicchedavicāraṇeṇa jñānabhūmim adhiśayānānāṃ tā eva bhagavatyaḥ saṃvicchaktayaḥ samāpatanty ananyā eva svayaṃ saṃvidaḥ*, where instead of the genitive *teṣāṃ ... adhiśayānānām*, used semi-absolutely, by attraction of the preceding genitive depending on *svarūpavimarśe*, we might

have expected an absolute locative. Lively and elliptic is the period on p. 226: *sarvatrātra sakṛdvibhātaṃ prasaṃkhyānagamyaṃ rūpaṃ mukhyataḥ tatrayogyānāṃ tu paraśaktipātapavitritānāṃ vṛthaindrajālikakalanālālasānāṃ vā yogābhyāsaḥ*, in which the *prasaṃkhyāna* and the *yoga* are placed in opposition one to the other, the former belonging to the number of those who have been purified by an advent of divine power, while the practice of the latter may be considered as vain tricks, of no spiritual value. Emphatic and poetic is the reiteration on p. 137 of the particle *atha* (*saṃbhedo 'tha vikāso 'tha*) instead of the simple *vā* (*saṃbhedo vikāso vā*).

These notes of mine lay no claim to settling all the still uncertain points of this text. My only purpose in writing them has been to make the reading of this work more accessible and to arouse the desire in others to study it, with, I hope, better results than mine. This has seemed to me the most important thing. *Si quid novisti rectius istis, candidus inperti.*

ABBREVIATIONS

The following abbreviations have been used: ABh = Abhinavabhāratī, Baroda, 1926-1954 (a second revised edition of the first volume has appeared in 1956); ABORI = Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute; AG = Abhinavagupta; APS = Utpaladeva's Ajaḍapramātṛsiddhi; BhG = Bhagavadgītā; BhGAS = Abhinavagupta's Bhagavadgītārthasaṃgraha, Srinagar, 1933; BV = Abhinavagupta's Īśvarapratyabhijñāvivṛtivimarśinī (known also as the Bṛhadvimarśinī); DhA = Ānandavardhana's Dhvanyāloka, Benares, 1940; J = Jayaratha; KSTS = Kashmir Series of Texts and Studies; LV = Abhinavagupta's Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī (known also as the Laghuvimarśinī); MM = Mahārthamañjarī, Trivandrum, 1919; MV = Mālinīvijayatantra; MVV = Abhinavagupta's Mālinīvijayavārttika; NM = Nyāyamañjarī (Benares, 1936); NT = Netratantra; PH = Pratyabhijñāhṛdaya; PK = Pratyabhijñākārikā; PT = Parātriṃśikā; SC = Stavacintāmaṇi; SD = Śivadṛṣṭi; SN = Spandanirṇaya; SpK = Spandakārikā; SS = Śivasūtra; SvT = Svacchandatantra; TA = Tantrāloka; TS = Tantrasāra; VBh = Vijñānabhairava; VP = Vākyapadīya (ed. of Lahore, 1939); YHṛ = Yoginīhṛdayatantra (Benares, 1930); YS = Yogasūtra.

In the lack of any evidence to the contrary, it is understood that the śaiva texts quoted above are published in the KSTS.

p.	l.	
3	12	For *parāmarśamayyā paśyantyā āsūtrayiṣyamāṇā*, read with G *parāmarśamayapaśyantyāsūtrayiṣyamāṇā°*.
4	1	Remove the comma after *°vibhinnā*.
4	3	Remove the comma after *nirūḍhā*. *Tāvat* should go into one word with the following *paśyanty°*.
4	6	For *abhīpsitam* A reads *īpsitam*. Equally good.
7	7	For *bodhasūtramātreṇa* A gives *bodhasūtraṇamātreṇa*, the better reading.
4	8-9	Remove the editorial note No. 14. In this passage, the meaning of *mecaka* is not *nīla* but the eye of a peacock's tail. See ib., p. 105, l. 7 and MVV, śl. 944-5.
5	5	*Tāvat* should go into one word with the following *vyavasthāyām*.
5	8	For *taduttaram*, A reads *taduttara°*. Equally good.
6	8	*Tat* should go into one word with the following *paśyantī°*.
6	10	After *saṃvit*, A adds *bhagavatī*. Equally good.
8	3	After *°gatiṣu*, A adds *iti*. Equally good.
10	1	For *svapto*, read obviously *supto*. For the sense, see f. ex. Speijer, Sanskrit Syntax, Leiden, 1886, paragraph 332.
10	last but one line	Remove the comma after *devī* and put the quotation mark before *devī*.
12	2	For *uktaṃ ca*, A reads *tad uktam*. Equally good.
12	3	The stanza *guruśiṣyapade sthitvā* is a quotation from SvT, vol. IV, p. 20 (VIII, śl. 31b-32a).
12	6	Put a daṇḍa after *iti*.
13	2	The Trikahṛdaya (also Trikasāra, Trikatantrasāra, Tantrasāra, Sāraśāstra, Mālinīsāra, etc.) was a well known tantra of this school.
13	3	For *parameśvaraḥ*, A and KH give *bhairavo vibhuḥ*. Equally good.
13	6	After *°paramārthamayatvāt*, A adds *eva*. Equally good.
13	10	A and Ṅ read *bhinnaṃ* for *bhinna°* in the printed text, which is the better reading.

p. l.	
14 1	A reads °*sāra akāraḥ kārarūpam iva* for °*sārākārākārarūpaśiva*° (i. e., the *bīja*-s A and Ā) in the printed text, which is the correct reading.
14 last line	For *prakāśamānaḥ*, A reads *prathamānaḥ*. Equally good.
15 6	A wrongly reads *ito madhyato* for *iti madhyato*.
15 last line	For °*kramāyoge* A and GH read °*kramāyogo* which seems to be better
17 6	Remove with A *triṃśikākhyam* after *abhidhānam*.
17 7	Read with A *akṣaravarṇasāmyāt* for *akṣaravādasāmyāt* (see below p. 241, ll. 3-4 and MM, p. 89).
17 10	See above, p. 13, l. 2.
18 10	A adds *'pi* after *māyīye*. This second *api* is, in my opinion, quite unnecessary.
18 13	The stanza *iti vā yasya saṃvittiḥ* is a quotation from SpK, II, 5.
19 2	For °*paryavasānam*, the better reading, A gives *paryavasānasthānam*.
19 4	A omits *atha*, which is however necessary.
20 7-8	A gives *tasyā api spandanākhyām* for *tato' pi spandanākhyām* in the printed text, which is the correct reading.
20 last line	A reads °*brahmarandhrabhairavabilā*° for *brāhmabhairavabilā*° in the printed text, which, reading, in my opinion, is the better one.
22 8	A omits *iti*. Equally good.
23 2-5	The gap indicated in the text by the two dotted lines does not really exist. After *saḥ, iti* must be added, with A. *Tadvat*, etc. (l. 5) is another passage borrowed from the same stotra.
23 11	The source of the pāda *uttarasyāpy anuttaram* is PT, 3 b.
24 3	For *saṃmohādhāyi*, A reads *saṃmohadāyi*. Equally good.
24 4	For *vaiśya*, A gives *viś*. Equally good.
24 7	The reading of A, *parāparādyāḥ*, seems to be better than that accepted in the printed text, i. e., *parādyāḥ*.
24 last line	For *guruḥ caitanyam* (A adds also a daṇḍa after *guruḥ*) the sense requires, in my opinion, *gurucaitanyam*.
25 8	The verses *evaṃ yo vetti tattvena* are a quotation from PT, 25.

p. l.	
26 2	For *śūnyapramātā*, A reads *śūnyaḥ pramātā*. Equally good.
27 2	A omits *ekam* after °*rūpam*. Equally possible.
27 4	For the better reading *abhedenaiva*, A gives *abhedenaivaṃ*.
27 6	The verse *jñānaṃ kriyā ca bhūtānām* is a quotation from PK, I, 4.
27 7	The *ca* after *tathā* is unnecessary. It is omitted by A.
27 12-13	The words *vakṣyamāṇanayena*, etc., up to *eva* are wrongly omitted by A.
28 9	For °*viśrāntyā svīkṛta*°, A reads °*viśrāntisvīkṛta*°. Equally good. The perception of the *idantā* is based, in fact, upon a *vicchinnacamatkāra*.
28 last but one line	For *akramaiva*, A gives *akramikaiva*. Equally good.
28 last line	A omits *vimarśa* which, in my opinion, is however necessary for the sense.
29 5	For *atiśayenāyaṃ śuklaḥ śuklataraḥ*, A reads *ayam sātiśayaḥ śukla iti śuklataraḥ*. Equally good.
29 8	Add, with A, a *ca* after *ayaṃ paṭaḥ*.
29 9	A adds *iti* after *sātiśayaḥ*. Equally good.
29 last line	A omits °*viśeṣā*° Equally good.
30 2	For *anayor ayam*, A reads *ayam anayoḥ*. Equally good.
30 11	After °*pekṣāyām*, A adds a *tu*, which is, in my opinion, quite unnecessary.
30 last but one line	The source of the verse *adyāpi yan na viditam* is unknown to me. For *bodhaśālinām*, which seems to be better, A gives *bhogaśālinām*.
31 3	The stanza *sakramatvaṃ ca laukikyāḥ* is a quotation from PK, II, 1, 2.
31 7	The stanza *anuttaraṃ taddhṛdayam* is a quotation from the lost Trikasāra (see above, p. 13, l. 2).
32 2	The pāda *hṛdaye yaḥ sthito granthiḥ* is a quotation from the same work. The verse is quoted in full in BV, III, 293, and runs as follows: *hṛdaye yaḥ sthito granthir adhaūrdhvaṃniyāmakaḥ*|
32 4	For °*rūpaparityāgena*, A reads °*rūpatyāgena*. Equally good.
32 10	For °*rthāniyamena*, which is the correct reading, A gives °*rthāḥ niyamena*.

p. l.	
33 1	The source of the words *saṃhatyakāritvāt* is unknown to me.
34 3	The *parivṛttya* of the printed text is perhaps to be corrected with A in *paranivṛttyā*. *Ānanda* is so defined in LV, I, p. 207: *anyanirapekṣataiva paramārthata ānandaḥ, aiśvaryam, svātantryam, caitanyaṃ ca.* Another possible reading is *paranirvṛtyā* (*nirvṛti* = *viśrānti, laya,* etc.).
34 7	The source of the stanza *vyatireketarābhyāṃ hi* is APS, 12.
35 8	The reading of A, *tac ced,* is, in my opinion, better than the *tat ca etat* of the printed text.
35 last but one line	The source of the stanza *saṃrudhya raśmicakraṃ svaṃ* is, as is indicated by Abhinava himself, the *Vādyatantra,* which, as it is supported by the MVV, that quotes the same stanza (I, 153: but *nirudhya* for *saṃrudhya* and °*paricchinne* for *paricchinnaṃ*), is no other than the *Ḍāmaratantra.*
36 1	A gives *vicāritaś* for *vistāritaś.* Equally good.
36 3	Read with A °*sukhādīnām* for °*sukhādīnā.*
36 6	For °*sopānārohenaiva* here the text is to be corrected into °*sopānānārohenaiva,* as we read in A.
37 4	The verse *bhāvanākaraṇābhyāṃ hi,* is a quotation from SD, VII, 101.
37 6 and p. 38, 1-2	The three verses *ekavāraṃ pramāṇena* are a quotation from SD, VII, 5b-6.
38 last line	A reads *mātrās tā* for *tā mātrā.* Equally good.
39 6	A gives *yeyam* for *iyam.* Equally possible.
39 14	A reads °*ekarūpa*° for °*aikyarūpa*°. Equally possible.
40 1	A omits °*rūpa*°. Equally good.
40 4	The source of the verse *śaktayo'sya jagat kṛtsnaṃ* is unknown to me. This stanza is quoted also in other works: see, for example, Jayaratha, TA, I, p. 155.
40 7	A adds a *ca* after *vyavasthāpanam.* Equally good.
41 8	The pāda *utsaratprakṛtiḥ śivaḥ* is a quotation from SD, III, 94, and should be corrected into *tat saratprakṛtiḥ śivaḥ.*
41 10	The verse *sukhe duḥkhe vimohe ca* is a quotation from SD, VII, 105.
42 1	The source of the verse *duḥkhe 'pi pravikāsena* is SD, V, 9. For *sthairyārthe* we read in the edited text of the SD *duḥkhārthe,* which is, in my opinion, the better reading. In the BV, II, 50, where Abhinava quotes again this verse, we read, however, *sthairyārtham.*
42 6	After *tā eva,* A adds, quite unnecessarily, *abhyantarakrodhādivṛttaya eva,* which looks like an explanatory addition of some later reader.
43 1	The source of the pāda *uccāṭane kākavakrā* is unknown to me.
43 3	Source untraced. For *eva,* A gives *etā.* Equally good.
43 10	The source of the verse *pīṭheśvaryo mahāghorā* is unknown to me.
43 12	The verse *viśayeṣv eva saṃlīnān* is a quotation from MV, III, 31.
43 14	The stanza *śabdarāśisamutthasya* is a quotation from SpK, III, 13.
44 3	The stanza *yadā tv ekatra saṃrūḍhas* is a quotation from SpK, III, 19.
44 6	After *vṛttiṣu,* A adds *krodhādiṣu* Equally good.
44 last but one line	For *yat tasya,* both A and KH read wrongly *yasya.*
45 3	For °*bheditabhāvo*°, A reads wrongly °*bheditadabhāvo*°.
46 1	For *madhya*°, A has *madhyama*°. Equally good.
46 4	A and G omit °*vīrya*°, which, indeed, seems to be unnecessary.
46 9	The source of the pāda *ālapād gātrasaṃsparśāt* is unknown to me.
47 1	For °*vikalpādi*°, A gives °*vikalpanādi*°, which seems to be better.
47 6-7	For °*mahāvimarśa*°, the correct reading is, in my opinion, °*mahāvisarga*° (see, f. ex., p. 48, l. 2). The scribal mistake of *vimarśa* for *visarga* and viceversa is a very easy one.
49 13	As to the pāda *duḥkhe 'pi pravikāsena,* see above, p. 42, l. 1.
50 2	A omits °*rūpa*°, which, in my opinion, is however better to preserve.
50 3	For °*nupraveśena,* which is the correct reading, A reads °*nupraveśe.*
50 11	For *parabrahma*°, A reads *paramabrahma*°. Equally good.
50 last but one line	The words *tataḥ sṛṣṭiṃ yajed* are a quotation from PT, 29 b. For *tataḥ* read *tatra.*

p.	l.	
51	1	The pāda *yathā nyagrodhabījastaḥ* is a quotation from PT, 24.
51	3	The source of the pāda *ity etad rudrayāmalam* is PT, 35 a.
51	5	The stanza *lehanāmanthanākoṭaiḥ* is a quotation from VBh, 70.
51	7	The passage *bharāt smaryamāṇo*, etc., up to *bhavati* is quoted by Śivopādhyāya, in his commentary on the VBh (p. 60). Both A and Śivopādhyāya read, for *saṃsparśaḥ*, *sa sparśaḥ*, which is, also in my opinion, the better reading. The other variants which we found in the Śivopādhyāya's text (°*parāśakti*° for °*parātmakaśakti*° and *unmukhaśākta*° for *tanmukhyaśākta*°) are, the first, unnecessary and the second surely wrong.
51	12	The stanza *śaktisaṃgamasaṃkṣobha*° is a quotation from VBh, 69.
51	last but one line	The source of the pāda *snehāt kaulikam ādiśet* is unknown to me.
52	1	The stanza *mama yonir mahad brahma* is a quotation from BhG, XIV, 3.
53	6	For *atiśaya*°, A reads *atiśayita*°. Equally good.
54	4	For *mahāguheti*, which is the better reading, A gives *mahāguhyeti*.
54	6	The source of the stanza *sā trikoṇā mahāvidyā* is unknown to me. For *trikonā* and *sarvarasā*°, A reads *trikoṇe* and *sukharasā*°. Equally possible.
54	last line	The source of the verse *udety ekaḥ samālokaḥ* is the lost Stotrabhaṭṭāraka or Kramastotra. On this work and its fragments a my separate article will appear in this review.
55	1	A gives wrongly *guhāguhāyām* for *mahāguhāyām*.
55	3-4	Remove the comma after *iti* and put a daṇḍa after *guhyam*.
55	5	The word °*bhāsā* should be one word with the following °*vimarśa*°.
55	6	After *ātma*°, A adds *mātṛ*. *Ātma*, *mātṛ*, which can be accepted without objection, and *vimarśaviśrāntirūpatvam* are three separate words.
55	9	The stanza *prakāśasyātmaviśrāntir* is a quotation from APS, 22.
56	3	After *punar api*, A adds a *ca*, which is unnecessary. In the same line, the reading of A, °*prasarabheda*° for °*prasarābheda*° is wrong.
57	2	A gives °*maye* for °*rūpe*, and *uktena nayena* for *uktanayena*. Equally good.
57	3	Add with A *mama* after *ca*.
57	9	A reads *adhikatādhāyi* for *adhikārthādhāyi*. Equally good.
57	10	The source of the quotation *saṃbodhanādhika*, etc. (A gives wrongly *saṃbodhanānadhika*), is unknown to me.
58	1	As to the pāda *guruśiṣyapade sthitvā* see above, p. 12, l. 3.
58	10	The source of the stanza *idam ity asya vicchinna*° is APS, 15.
58	13	The stanza *ghaṭo 'yam ity adhyavasā* is a quotation from PK, I, 5, 20.
59	3	For *ityādi*, A has *iti* only. Equally possible.
59	5	For °*rūpatvāt*, A has °*rūḍhatvāt*. Equally possible.
59	9	*Yat* should go into one word with the following *bheda*°. For °*vasānā*, read with A °*vāsanā*.
60	4	Delete the comma after *mā* and put it after *yatra*.
60	last but one line	For °*praśnatātparya*°, A and KH read °*praśnārthatātparya*°. Equally good.
61	11	For *vīryabhūtā*, which is, in my opinion, the correct reading, A reads *sarūpā*.
61	12	*Nikhilākṣanādīcakrasya madhyamadhyamarūpā* looks like an interpolation and is missing in A.
62	3	*Yad uktam* up to *iti* is omitted by A.
62	12	For *paramādvayanirvṛtisvātantryarasābhavāmi* read *paramādvayanirvṛtisvātantryarasībhavāmi*.
62	13	For *ity api pāṭhaḥ*, A gives *ity apapāṭhaḥ*. Equally possible.
63	1	For *prakaṭitam eva*, A gives *prakaṭitam* only. Equally good. For *svavivṛtau*, which is, in my opinion, the correct reading, A reads *svavṛttau*.
64	5	For *prasaradharmatva*° one expects here *prasaradharmatvāt*.
66	9	For *saṃvidekaghanaśaktiḥ*, A gives *saṃvidekaghanā śaktiḥ*. Equally good.
67	1	For *ucyate*, A gives *uktā*. Equally good.

p. l.	
67 2	The verses *aparasthito* (read *aparasthitau*), etc., are a quotation from SD, I, 26-27.
67 5	Delete, with A, *rūpe*.
67 last line	For °*vartino bhāvān*, A reads °*vartibhāvān*. Equally good.
69 5	The stanza *trailokye 'py atra yo yāvān* is a quotation from StC, 61.
69 7	For *rūpaṃ tad eva* A reads *tad eva rūpam*. Equally good.
69 12	After *tiṣṭhantī* the sense requires a daṇḍa.
70 4-5	In my opinion, the *na* before *varṇān* should be removed and for *kalakalasyaiva bhāvāt* the text should be corrected, with KH, into *kalakalasyaivābhāvāt*.
70 6	The *ca* after *kalakalasya* should apparently be removed.
70 8-9	For °*śabdotpattyanupapatteḥ*, which is no doubt the correct reading, both A and K read °*śabdotpattyupapatteḥ*.
70 last line	Put a daṇḍa after *kalakalaśabdavācyāḥ*.
71 last but one line	The verse *ātmanā śrūyate yas tu* is a quotation by heart from SvT, II, 146 b.
72 3	For *nikaṭataravarti*°, A reads *nikaṭavarti*. Equally good.
72 5	The verse *paraiḥ saṃśrūyate yas tu* is an approximate quotation from SvT II 147 a (cf. also TA, vol. X, p. 339).
73 1	For *sphuṭa*°, the sense apparently requires *'sphuṭa*°.
73 last line	For *kevalaṃ*, A reads *kevala*°. Equally good.
74 1	For *mukhyatayā*, A gives *mukhyato*. Equally good.
74 3	*Yad* (or *yadā*) should be separated from the following *āmantryamāṇatayā*.
74 5	Remove the comma after *rūpaṃ* and put a daṇḍa after *iti*.
74 last but one line	Remove the comma after *iti*.
75 1	For *yathārthena* the original reading seems to have been *yuṣmadarthena*.
75 6	The stanza *yasmāt kṣaram atīto 'ham* is a quotation from BhG XV 18.
76 8	For °*nirdeśyābhāva*° the sense requires °*nirdeśyabhāva*°.
77 1	For °*bhedāvabhāsasyānantaśarīrādy* one should probably read °*bhedāvabhāsy anantaśarīrādy* [G reads °*bhedāvabhāsyānantaśarīrādy*].
78 1	Put a daṇḍa after *pratītisadbhāvāt*.
78 2	For °*śivātmakatvam*, A reads °*śivatātmatvam*. Equally good.
78 3-4	Remove the comma before *aham* and put a daṇḍa after *pratyayāt*.
78 8	Remove the comma after *svātantryam*.
78 last line	Put a daṇḍa after °*pratītimayam*.
79 3	The source of the verse *ekaṃ vastu dvidhā bhūtam* is unknown to me.
79 4-5	*Śivatā* should be separated from the following *pratiyogisaṃbhave*.
79 6	Put a daṇḍa before *ekasyaiva*. For *ghaṭau*, A reads *ghaṭapaṭau*. Equally good.
79 9	The source of the verse *anekam ekadhā kṛtvā* is unknown to me.
80 8	The source of the words *na hṛdayaṃgamagāminī gīḥ*, which, as AG says, are borrowed from a work of his, is unknown to me.
80 11	The verse *na tair vinā bhavec chabdo* is borrowed, according to BV III 384, where it is quoted, from the Sarvavīratantra.
80 13	The stanza *evaṃ sarvāṇusaṃghātam* is a quotation from MV III 34, the only variation being that for *etāḥ* and *sthitāḥ* there is *evaṃ* and *sthitā*.
81 11	*Anādare ṣaṣṭhī* is a quotation from Pāṇini, 2, 3, 38.
82 2	The source of the stanza *paravyavasthāpi pare* is unknown to me.
84	The source of the words *yataḥ sarvam* is a well known verse, often quoted in these schools. The entire kārikā runs as follows: *yasmin sarvaṃ yataḥ sarvaṃ yaḥ sarvaṃ sarvataś ca yaḥ* | *yaś ca sarvamayo nityaṃ tasmai sarvātmane namaḥ* ||. See Rāmakaṇṭha's commentary on the BhG, pp. 2-3.
85 5	For *eva*, which is the correct reading, A gives *iva*.
85 last line	For *yady atra* read with A *yad yatra*. See p. 83, where AG says *yataḥ syāt ayaṃ kauliko vidhiḥ*, etc. This is another explanation of the

p. l.

word *anuttara*, in the sense that it is no longer that from which (*yat* = *yasmāt*) the *kauliko vidhiḥ* arises, but that on which (*yat* = *yatra*) the *kauliko vidhiḥ* is based.

86 7 For *yasmin sarvam* see 84, 1.

87 10 Remove the comma after *bindvātmaśaktau* and put it after *ma iti*.

88 2-3 For *anapahnavanīyam anuttaram*, which is, in my opinion, the better reading, A gives *anapahnavanīyena nyāpekṣaprathaṃ anuttaram* (correct *anapahnavanīyam ananyāpekṣaprathaṃ anuttaram*). Equally possible.

88 4 The source of the verse *yatra sthitam idaṃ sarvam* is SpK I 2.

88 last but one line For *yac ca*, which is the correct reading, A reads *yaś ca*.

89 4-5 For *'vicchinnaikatāparamārthaḥ*, which is the better reading, A gives *'vicchinnaikaparamārthaḥ*. The comma after °*paramārthaḥ* should be removed.

89 6 *Parābhaṭṭārikodayabhāgi* should be separated from *vaikharyantam*.

89 9 For *sarvataś ca yaḥ* see 84, 1.

90 4 For *nirmalayya*, which is, in my opinion, the correct reading, both A and KH read *nirdalayya*.

90 5-6 Remove the hyphen and the quotation marks after *iti* and °*dhāmatayā*.

91 5 The pāda *tad asti paramārthataḥ* is a quotation from SpK, 1, 5.

91 7 Somānanda's verse *yat tat sat paramārtho hi* is probably borrowed from his lost commentary on the PT.

91 9 For *yaḥ sarvam* cf. 84, 1.

91 last line For *parāt parataraṃ trikam* read with A and KH *kulāt parataram trikam* (cf. below 163, 6). Source untraced. The entire *kārikā* is quoted in the commentary on the VBh, p. 4, the only variation being that for *kulam* and *kulāt* there is *kaulam* and *kaulāt*, and runs as follows: *vedādibhyaḥ paraṃ śaivaṃ śaivād vāmaṃ tu dakṣiṇam | dakṣiṇāt parataḥ kaulaṃ kaulāt parataraṃ trikam* ||.

92 2 The stanza *vedāc chaivaṃ tato vāmaṃ* is quoted also from J, TA, vol. I, p. 49. Source untraced.

92 13 For the verse *yaś ca sarvamayo nityam* see 84, 1.

p. l.

96 6 The sense requires, in my opinion, a daṇḍa after *etāvataiva*.

96 last line Remove the comma after *cottareṇa*.

100 6 A reads *sūtritā* | *evaṃ dhūlibheda*°, for *sūtritaiva* | *dhūlibheda*°. Equally good. On the sense of *dhūlibheda*, litterally 'cut the dust', and therefore metaphorically to split syllables and words so as to give to each of them various meanings, see Kṣemarāja, NT, I, 51.

102 11 Here up to p. 144 begins the explanation of the *parā vāk*.

102 last line Read with A °*sṛṣṭi*° for °*mṛṣṭi*°.

103 4 Remove the comma after *eva*.

103 7 Put a comma after °*malaiḥ*.

103 8 A has *tv akṛtrimā* for *tu kṛtrimā*, which in my opinion is the correct reading.

103 10 The quotation from Kallaṭa *tutipāte sarvajñasarvakartṛtvalābhaḥ* is borrowed from a lost work of his, the Tattvārthacintāmaṇi (so Jayaratha, TA, X, 142. Cf. also MVV, I, śl. 177).

106 3-4 Read *unmeṣapratibhādiśabdāgamagītam* for *unmeṣapratibhādi, śabdāgamagītam* and delete the editorial note No. 1 at the foot of the page.

107 3-6 The text is difficult and may be corrupt. A has *sahajāsāmayikatayā* for *sahajāsāmayikatathā*°, *bhedād ullāsād* for *bhedānullāsād*, and *vikalpatam* (sic!) for *vikalpatulyatvam*.

108 5 Read with A *evaṃvidhaparicchinna*° for *evaṃvidhā aparicchinna*°. At the time of teaching, meditating, etc., consciousness is *kalpita, paricchinna*.

110 1 Read °*dharmiṇi* for °*dharmaṇi*.

110 2-3 A has *parihṛtā eva bhavanti* for *parihṛtā bhavanti*. Equally good.

111 6 The stanza *glānir viluṇṭhikā dehe* is borrowed from SpK, III, 8.

111 9 The śloka *ekacintāprasaktasya* is borrowed from SpK, III, 9.

111 17 The verse *malam ajñānam icchanti* is borrowed from MV, I, 23.

112 5 The *nyāya* implicit in the sentence *iti nṛpanirūpaṇaprāyam eva bhavet* is, in my opinion, a variant of the well known *nyāya* of the *rājaśāsana* (cf. f. ex. NM, II, 106).

p. l.

112 6-9 The prakṛt stanza by AG is not clear to me. The text is very corrupt and until new MSS are found it is very difficult that it should be restored.

112 13 A has °*prapañcabodharūpa*° for *prapañcaprabodhaikya*°. Equally good.

114 2 The stanza *ātmaiva sarvabhāveṣu* is borrowed from the SD, I, 2 (cf. my translation of it, EW, VIII, I, 1959, pp. 16-22).

114 5 The pāda *yatra sthitam idaṃ sarvam* is borrowed by the SpK I 2.

116 3 Read with A *eva dhriyamāṇān* for *eva ādhriyamāṇān*.

116 7 Put a daṇḍa after °*napāyo*.

116 11 Read with A and KH *preryo' pi* for *preṣo' pi*.

116 13-14 The stanza *apravṛttasya hi praiṣe* is from Vākyapadīya, p. 259 (Benares edition, Saṃpradānādhikāra). The text of the Benares edition contains some variants and it runs as follows: *dravyamātrasya tu praiṣe pṛcchyāder loḍ vidhīyate* | *sakriyasya prayogas tu yadā sa viṣayo ṇicaḥ* || The reading *pṛcchyāder* seems better than *pracchāder*, while the sense given by *apravṛttasya* and *pravṛttasya* is as good as the *dravyamātrasya* and the *sakriyasya* in the Benares edition.

117 2 The Tantrasāra here quoted was a very important ritualistic work of this school. It is also called Trikasāra, Trikahṛdaya, Sāraśāstra, etc. (cf. above, p. 13, l. 2).

118 1 The verse *māyordhve śuddhavidyādhas* is often quoted (cf. f. ex. TA, VI, p. 78). Source untraced.

118 7-8 *Tatra vijñānakevalo malaikayukta iti* is a quotation from MV, I, 22-3.

119 2 Delete the comma after *bhavanti* and put, with A, a daṇḍa after *iti*.

119 3 The verse *vijñānakevalān aṣṭau* is borrowed from MV, I, 19.

119 5 The verse *mantramaheśvareśatve* is borrowed from MV, I, 21.

121 3 The verse *ādya* (read *ādyam*) *dhārikayā vyāptam* is borrowed from MV, II, 50.

122 1 The verse *phe dharātattvam uddiṣṭam* is borrowed from MV, IV, 15. For *cādi-ñānte* read *dādi-jhānte*.

123 1 The verse *niṣphale padam ekārṇam* is borrowed from MV, IV, 19 (cf. also TA, XI, 72 and XVI, 84). For *tryarṇaikārṇadvayaṃ dvaye* read *tryarṇāikārṇam iti* (or *atha*) *dvayam* (cf. opp. citt.).

123 3-4 A has °*krameṇa tattvayojanā* for °*krameṇa pārthivāditattvanirūpaṇā yojitā*. Equally good.

123-4 4 sqq. The passage from *punar api* up to *tattvayojanā* (p. 124 l. 4) should be eliminated. It is obviously due to a printer's error and is a mere repetition of 122, l. 4 and 121, ll. 6 sqq.

124 6 The stanza *sārdhenāṇḍadvayaṃ vyāptam* is borrowed from MV, IV, 24.

124 11 The stanza *sārṇena tritayaṃ vyāptam* is borrowed from MV, IV, 25.

125 last line *Prasiddho hi na saṃketo* should, in my opinion, be corrected into *prasiddho hi naḥ saṃketo*.

126 1 Put a daṇḍa after °*prakalpitaḥ* and read *tan nāmākṣara*° for *tannāmākṣara*° and cf. for the meaning ABh, II, 384; BV, III, p. 99; SvT, III, 308.

127 13 Read with A *pṛthivītyādīti ko 'yaṃ kramaḥ* (cf. ib., p. 120, l. 5) for *pṛthivī ityādiko 'yaṃ kramaḥ*.

128 3 The verse *īśvaraṃ ca mahāpretam* is borrowed from MV, VIII, 68.

128 6 The pāda *ity etat sarvam āsanam* is borrowed from MV, VIII, 68.

129 1 The verse *tasya nābhyutthitaṃ śakti*° is borrowed from MV, VIII, 69.

129 3 Read with A *aunmanaso*° for *unmanaso*°.

129 9 The stanza *athāsmākaṃ jñānaśaktir* is borrowed from SD, II, 1.

129 12 *Pratyagātmani hi buddhiḥ*, etc., is not a verse but forms part of the text.

130 6 A has *māyāpade cāpi* for *māyāpade 'pi*. Equally good.

131 2 For *parāparāśaktiḥ* the sense requires *parāśaktiḥ*. Cf. BV, III, 275 and 366. *Īśvarāvasthāyām* etc. (130, last l.) seems to be a quotation from the lost *ṭīkā* of UD.

132 2-3 Read °*paramārthād anyat « aham aham idaṃ punar idam eva » iti saṃvit*, for °*paramārthāt « anyad aham » « idam punar idam eva » iti saṃvit*.

132 4-5 Read with A and G °*paramārthe 'pi rūpe nāhaṃ nedam*, for °*paramārthenāpi rūpeṇa « ahaṃ nedam »*.

p.	l.	
133	3	Delete the comma after *śarīrādi* and *aham* and put a comma after the first *aham*.
133	9	Read *tathāsāmarthyaṃ* and *tathāsāmarthyayogāt* for *tathā sāmarthyaṃ* and *tathā sāmarthyayogāt*.
133	last but one line	Put a daṇḍa after *pratibimbenāpi* and delete the comma after *kevalam*.
134	1	A omits *ca* after *evaṃ*. Equally good.
134	4	A reads *tattvabhāvavikāsam ātmamayam* for *tattvabhāvavikāsātmamayam* in the text, which is the better reading.
134	7	Read *tadbhāvi*° for *tad bhāvi*°.
134	9	Read *tathābhavac ca* for *tathā bhavac ca*.
134	10	Read *dṛṣṭau*, as required by the sense, for *sṛṣṭau*. In Śāradā script confusion between *sṛ* and *dṛ* is very easy. An example of it can be seen in TS, 140, l. 4, where one must read, on the contrary, *sṛṣṭi*° for *dṛṣṭi*° (cf. TA, XV, 238).
134	11	Read *tatpūrvasya* for *tat pūrvasya*.
134	13	Read °*bhāvarāśi khaṇḍitābhedam* for °*bhāvarāśikhaṇḍitābhedam*.
135	3	*Vijṛmbheta* after *bhāseta* is perhaps a gloss by a commentator, which later on was inserted in the text.
135	4	Read *mā prathiṣṭha* (aorist, from *prath* –) for *mā pratiṣṭha*°.
135	last line	Read °*pūrvagatā bhāsā* for °*pūrvagatābhāsā*.
136	6	Put a daṇḍa after *prasaṃkhyānaparāḥ*.
136	11	The source of the verse *nirvṛkṣagiribhittyādau* is VBh, 60 (cf. also BV, II, 427).
137	10	Put a daṇḍa after *siddham* and after *vimatiḥ*.
137	12	Put a daṇḍa after *adhiśete*.
137	16	Read with A °*prarūḍhabheda*° for °*prarūḍhābheda*°.
138	3	*Dharāyā* looks like a gloss made by some reader who felt the need of explaining *asyāḥ* at p. 237, l. 15, immediately before the very long compound word that begins with *paripūrṇa*° (more than 40 words).
138	14	Put a daṇḍa after *dharā*.
138	16	Read *tadbhāsāvimarśa*° for *tadbhāsā vimarśa*° and, with A, *antaḥkṛtatathāvidha*° for *antaḥkṛtya tathāvidha*°.
139	1-2	*Pradeśamātram api brahmaṇaḥ sarvarūpam* is a citation by heart of a vedantic passage quoted by Bhartṛhari in his *ṭīkā* and very often by this school. The complete passage runs as follows: *pradeśo 'pi brahmaṇaḥ sārvarūpyam anatikrāntaś cāvikalpaś ca* (VP, *ṭikā*, ed. of Lahore, p. 20). This passage has been commented on by AG in his BV, I, 44. The other quotation *ekaikatrāpi ca tattve ṣaṭtriṃśattattvamayatvam* is from an untraced śaiva source (cf. f. ex. Sv.T., 4, 59).
139,	5	The source of the stanza *didṛkṣayeva sarvārthān* is SpK, III, 11.
139	7	A and G have *carameṇa cārdhenaitad* for *carameṇa pādena tad*, which is the better reading.
139	9	Read *tāvatsvarūpam* for *tāvat svarūpam*.
139	10	Read with A *vṛkṣatvasvarūpam* for *vṛkṣasya svarūpam*. In the same line, for °*svātantryatirohita*° read °*svātantryātirohita*°. On the expression *niyativijṛmbhā*, cf. BV, II, pp. 27-8. The comma after °*svarūpam* should be removed.
139	last line	After °*vijṛmbhāyām* there should be a daṇḍa. In the same line, for *yāvat svarupam* read *yāvatsvarūpam*.
140	3	Separate *jalādi* from *pūrvapūrvam*. They are two different words.
140	4-5	For *dhṛter eva kāṭhinyadarśanāt*, which is quite nonsensical, one expects here *sruter* (or *druter*) *eva kāṭhinye darśanāt*.
140	10	Remove with A *vinā* and, after it, the comma after *bhoktāram*.
140	11	After *saṃkucitam* the comma should be removed.
140	12	°*kalādi* should be joined as one word with *pāśajālam*.
140	14-5	Remove the comma after *vinā* and put it after *saṃkucitatvam*.
140	15-6	For *saṃkoce saṃkucitatāsāratatsaṃkocitatāratamyāpekṣi*, read with A (except the *avagraha*, which is mine) *saṃkoce 'saṃkucitatāsāratatsaṃkocatāratamyākṣepi*.
141	3	For *tattvakramaḥ*, A has *tāttvaḥ kramaḥ*. Equally good.
141	3	For *śrutir api* read *srutir* (or *drutir*) *api*. Cf. p. 140, ll. 4-5 and my suggestions. The editorial note No. 1 should be removed.

p. l.

141 5 For *iti*, A has *ityādi*. Equally good.

141 5-6 For *kiṃ na chedayet* read with G *kiṃ naś chedayet* (cf. also DhA, p. 448) and put a comma after it.

141 7 To *sarvaś cāyam* the word *kramaḥ* should be understood.

142 last line For °*matā*° read °*śatā*°.

143 13 For *saṃpuṭeyoge* read with A *saṃpuṭayoge*. *Saṃpuṭayoga*, *saṃpuṭīkaraṇa*, etc., is a reference to PT, śl. 30 a. Cf. also TS, 200.

144 2 The stanza *yat sadāśivaparyanta*° is often quoted (cf. f. ex. BV, III, 268, TA, V, 263, YHr, I, 116) and is a quotation from SvT, V, 548.

145 1 Put a comma after *tad evāpi*.

145 4 Read with A °*kramapūrṇa*° for °*kramam apūrṇa*.

146 11 For *parāparāmarśamayī* read with A *parāparāparāmarśamayī*.

147 2 Separate *ityādi* from *śodhya*°.

147 6 For °*vartamāna*° A has °*bhāsamāna*°. Equally good.

147 6 The comma after °*prāvaṇyāt* should be removed.

147 last line After *tatrabhavantaḥ* there should be a full stop. Now AG begins to expound the *madhyamā vāk*..

148 5 For *tatrāpi* A has *tatrāpi ca*. Equally good.

148 7 For *paraṃparācchādanamiśrībhāvātmani* read with A, K and G, *parasparācchādanalolībhāvātmā*.

148 13 The verse *bījam atra śivaḥ śaktir* is a citation from MV, III, 12.

148 15 The stanza *bījayonyātmakād bhedād* is a citation from the same work, III, 10.

148 last line Put a daṇḍa after °*nirūpaṇād*.

149 2 Put a daṇḍa after *vācyā*.

149 7 For *ata eva* A has *ata eva ca*. Equally good.

150 6 For °*gamana*° should we not read °*gamane*?

151 1 Separate °*madhyamādhāma* from *śaktisatattvam*.

151 3 The stanza *yatheṣṭaphalasaṃsiddhyai* is a citation from MV, III, 35-6.

151 5 Put a daṇḍa after *iti*.

151 6 The stanza *na puṃsi na pare tattve* is often quoted (cf. f. ex. TA, vol. III, p. 425; vol. X, p. 136). Source untraced.

151 last line Read with A *abhihitehatya*° for *abhihitā ihatya*°.

152 7 For °*śrayaṇa*° A has °*śrayeṇa*. Equally good.

152 9 Put a daṇḍa after °*samāviṣṭam*

152 9 Read with A °*rūpānusṛtyā* for °*rūpānumūrtyā*.

152 11 *Tatsāmānyā śuddhavidyā karaṇe* should go into one word: *tatsāmānyāśuddhavidyākaraṇe*.

153 1 For *ihatyāparasaṃvidanusṛtyā*, the sense requires *ihatyaparasaṃvidanusṛtyā*.

153 2 sqq. The text of this page up to p. 154, l. 4, is extremely corrupt. In these ll. AG expounds which are the various *tattva*-s to which each letter corresponds according to the alphabetical orders they have in *Parā*, *Paśyantī*, and *Madhyamā*, in which the various letters are arranged in the order known as *mālinī*. This is the concordance (cf. below, p. 203):

154 7 For °*madhyamadhāmni* read °*madhyamādhāmni*.

154 12 For *kuladehais* we should read with A *kuladevais*. Untraced source.

154 14 Put a daṇḍa after *iti*.

155 7 A reads °*samudita*° for °*samucita*° in the edited text, which is the better reading.

155 last but one line For °*śrīmantrādiphānta*° we should read °*śrīmannādiphānta*° (N and PH are respectively the first and last letter of the *mālinī* order).

156 4 The stanza *ity etan mātṛkācakram* is from an untraced source.

156 10 For the last verse of these two stanzas, see TA, XI, 64 and SS, 51.

156 15 For *kaulottarādau* read with A *kālottarādau*.

157 6 sqq. The sense of these two stanzas is not quite clear to me. They are probably two *saṃgrahaśloka* of AG himself. In the first verse, for *bhedasaṃkhyeṣu*, we should perhaps read *bhedāsaṃkhyeṣu*.

157 10 *Yathoktaṃ kulaśaktīnāṃ vidhir ānantyavedane* is probably not a verse but forms part of the text. In this case, one should read *yathoktaṃ kulaśaktīnāṃ vidhir ānantyavedane[ti] tad etena vidhinā*, etc.

157 13-15 The three verses *brahmādistambaparyante* are a quotation from the MV, I, 40 seqq. These three verses are quoted also in SN, p. 46;

Parā (according to the PT)	Paśyantī (mātṛkā or śabdarāśi)	Madhyamā (mālinī)	Tattva
A	A	N	
Ā	Ā	Ṛ	
I	I	Ṝ	
Ī	Ī	Ḷ	
U	U	Ḷ 3	
Ū	Ū	TH	
Ṛ	Ṛ	C	
Ṝ	Ṝ	DH	Śiva
Ḷ	Ḷ	Ī	
Ḷ 3	Ḷ 3	Ṇ	
E	E	U	
AI	AI	Ū	
O	O	B	
AU	AU	K	
AṂ	AṂ	KH	
AḤ	AḤ	G	
KṢ	K	GH	sadāśiva
H	KH	Ṅ	īśvara
S	G	I	śuddhavidyā
Ṣ	GH	A	māyā
Ś	Ṅ	V	kalā
V	C	BH	aśuddhavidyā
L	CH	Y	rāga
R	J	Ḍ	niyati
Y	JH	ḌH	kāla
M	Ñ	ṬH	puruṣa
BH	Ṭ	JH	prakṛti
B	ṬH	Ñ	buddhi
PH	Ḍ	J	ahaṃkāra
P	ḌH	R	manaḥ
N	Ṇ	Ṭ	śrotra
DH	T	P	tvac
D	TH	CH	cakṣuḥ
TH	D	L	rasana
T	DH	Ā	ghrāṇa
Ṇ	N	S	vāc
ḌH	P	AḤ	pāṇi
Ḍ	PH	H	pāyu
ṬH	B	Ṣ	upastha
Ṭ	BH	KṢ	pāda
Ñ	M	M	śabda
JH	Y	Ś	sparśa
J	R	AṂ	rūpa
CH	L	T	rasa
C	V	E	gandha
Ṅ	Ś	AI	ākāśa
GH	Ṣ	O	vāyu
G	S	AU	tejaḥ
KH	H	D	jala
K	KṢ	PH	pṛthivī

The text may be easily restored as follows: *vāyur māyā ca GH sādākhyam | nabhaḥ kalā ca Ṅ īśvaraḥ | icchaiva śaktimayī I śuddhavidyā | anuttara eva svatantro 'haṃbhāva A śivākhyo māyā | aśuddhavidyā gandhaś ca V kalā | prakṛtiḥ pādendriyaṃ ca ḌH aśuddhavidyā | kālaḥ sparśaś ca Y rāgaḥ | pāyur ahaṃkṛc ca Ḍ niyatiḥ | hastau manaś ca ḌH kālaḥ | ānandendriyaṃ buddhiś ca ṬH pumān | sparśaḥ kālaś ca JH prakṛtiḥ | śabdaḥ pumāṃś ca Ñ dhīḥ | rūpaṃ niyatiś ca J ahaṃkṛtam | niyatī rūpaṃ ca R manaḥ | pādendriyaṃ prakṛtiś ca Ṭ śrotram | mano hastaś ca P tvak | raso rāgaś ca CH netre | rāgo rasaś ca L rasanā | ānandaśaktiḥ śaivī Ā ghrāṇam | vidyā tejaś ca S vāk | visargaśaktiś ca AḤ karau | īśo jalaṃ ca H pāyuḥ | māyā vāyuś ca Ṣ ānandendriyam | sādākhyaṃ pṛthivī ca KṢ pādau | pumān śabdaś ca M śabdaḥ | kalā nabhaś ca Ś sparśaḥ | baindavī śivaśakti AṂ rūpaṃ | nāsikā tvak ca T rasaḥ | śivaśaktiḥ sāttvī E gandhaḥ | saiva dīrghā AI nabhaḥ | tathaiva vāyutejasī O AU | netre rasaś ca D āpaḥ | ahaṃkṛt pāyuś ca PH pṛthivī |*

p. l.

TA, vol. V, p. 230; SvT, vol. V b, p. 490; NT, I, 52.

158 1 The verse *abhinnayonimadhye* is from an untraced source.

158 4 For *anantā pariganana*° read into one word *anantāparigaṇana*°.

158 12 After °*malasyeva* put a daṇḍa and remove the comma after *tat*, which should form one word with the following *parābhaṭṭārikā*°.

158 13 Put a daṇḍa after *vimṛśyate*.

158 16 For *hi utpattir* read with A *vyutpattir*.

159 7 For *rūpī eva* read with A *rūpa eva*.

159 8 Put a daṇḍa after *vaikharī*.

159 9-10 For *evoktam* A has *evety uktam*. Equally good.

159 13 A omits *jāte*. Equally good.

160 7 A has °*bhedātmaka*° for °*bhedātmano* in the text, which is the best reading.

160 10 The stanza *asmadrūpasamāviṣṭaḥ* is a quotation from SD, I, 1.

160 last line Put a *daṇḍa* after *iti*. For °*sūcakam* the text requires °*sūcakatvam*, and so far as the sense is concerned, see ŚD, comm. of Utpaladeva, p. 4, ll. 1-2.

161 3 The source of the stanza *tyaja dharmam adharmaṃ ca* is a quotation from Mahābharata, Śāntiparvan. The last pāda of this stanza is quoted in BV, III, 286.

161 5-7 Text and meaning doubtful. For *śrīṣaḍardhaśāstre evoktam, evotkarṣah*, A reads *śrīṣaḍardhaśāstre evotkarṣaḥ*. See however the expression *anya utkarṣaḥ* (p. 163, l. 5). Should one not read *śrīṣaḍardhaśāstre evaika utkarṣaḥ*? In any case, after *utkarṣaḥ* a daṇḍa is necessary. The *ṣaḍardhaśāstra* is a well known name for the *Mālinīvijaya*.

161 8 The sentence *vakti hy anyat* etc., is a reference to Dharmakīrti, PV, III, 207 (see also BV, II, 415; III, 140, 389; and PH, 40).

161 12 Put a daṇḍa after °*napalāpanīyatvāt*.

161 13 The source of the pāda *tathāsaukṣmyād alakṣaṇam* is unknown to me. A very similar expression (*saukṣmyāt tu na vibhāvyate*) is to be found in a stanza quoted by AG himself in BhGAS, p. 16.

p. l.

161 14 The *śirīṣakusumapallavaśatavyatibheda* is a variant of the well known *nyāya* of the apparently simultaneous piercing of one hundred lotus leaves (*utpalapatraśatavyatibheda*), on which see the *Laukikanyāyāñjali*, II, 77-8.

162 3 For *ko'sya viśeṣo jñānamukhenoktaḥ*, A, K and G read *kosya niveśo jñānamukhe noktaḥ*, which, except for *kosya* that must be corrected into *kasya*, is probably the right reading.

162 5 Put a daṇḍa after *doṣaḥ*.

162 6 A omits °*śata*° and *ca*. Equally good.

162 7 For *ucyamāne* and, at the following line, *āpatet*, A gives *ucyamānam* and *āpatayet*. Equally good, *Sūkṣmaḥ* should form one word with the following *paramāṇvantā*°.

162 10 For *tasyāś ca* A reads *tasya ca*. Equally good.

162 10 For *'nubhavābhāvāt* in the printed text read with A *'nubhavābhāvābhāvāt*.

163 6 As far as the pāda *kulāt parataraṃ trikam* is concerned, see p. 91, l. 16.

163 14 Put a daṇḍa after *mantavyam*.

163 15 Put a daṇḍa after *śodhya eva*.

163 16 °*saṃvidabhedi* should obviously form one word with the following *hutavaha*.

164 1 The pāda *evaṃ yo vetti tattvena* is a quotation from PT, śl. 25.

164 4 The verse *parāparāṅgasaṃbhūtā* is a quotation from MV, III, 59 (see also TA, XVI, 85).

164 8-9 For *nātivyāptir* A reads *nāvyāptir*, which is equally possible.

164 last line Put a daṇḍa after *vimarśaśaktiḥ*.

165 2 For °*padāviṣṭatvāt* A has °*padāviśiṣṭatvāt*. Equally good. The meaning of the following sentence, *turyānantaratāyā api samānatvāt* is not quite clear to me.

165 5 For °*ubhayātma*° A has °*ubhayātmaka*°. Equally good.

166 9-10 The passage, *akramasya tu tatpūrvakeṇa saṃvidy eva bhāvāt pratipādanāya astu sarvathaiva sakramatvāt*, requires corrections at three places: 1) The adversative particle *tu* should go (so A); 2) for *tatpūrvakeṇa* the sense requires *tatpūrvakatvena* and 3) for *pratipādanāya astu*

p.	l.	
		in the printed text read *pratipādanāyās tu.*
167	8	For *sā cāvasthānena* read *sā cāvastyānena.*
167	9	A reads *vyapadeśiṣyamāṇādyanudrekā* for *vyapadeśyā iṣyamāṇānudrekā,* which is the correct reading.
168	1	Put a daṇḍa after *°satteyam.*
168	2	Remove the daṇḍa after *prasṛtā* and put it after *iti.*
169	7	The pāda *tatra sṛṣṭiṃ yajet* is a citation from PT, śl. 28.
169	11	For *°bhutā kula°* read *°bhūtākula°.*
169	12	For *prasaratprāktana* the correct reading should be either *prasaratatprāktana°* (A) or *prasarattatprāktana°* (G).
169	last but one line	The reading of A, *apekṣya,* for the *avekṣya* in the printed text, is the better one.
169	last line	Remove the quotation mark before *atrānavasthā* and the hyphen after it.
170	3	Remove the quotation mark after *°prasaṅgāt* and put a daṇḍa after *vācyam.*
170	7	For *tadrūpakarburībhāva°* one should perhaps read *tadrūpakarburībhāve.*
170	last line	For *anuttarānandeccheśanonmeṣaṇe na tv animeṣāṇām,* read with A and G *anuttarānandeccheśanonmeśonatvanimeṣāṇām. Ūnatva* is the vowal Ū.
171	1	Remove the comma after *svarūpavimarśe.*
171	7	The stanza *svapadā svaśiraśchāyām* is a quotation from the lost Tantrasāra (Trikasāra, Sāraśāstra, etc.). This stanza is often quoted: see f. ex. MVV, śl. 912 and BV, I, 66.
172	6	After *vyapasarati* remove the hyphen and put a comma at its place.
172	6-7	For *avyapadeśarūpatvāt* read with A *avyapadeśyarūpatvāt* and remove the comma after it.
171-2	last and first l.	For *paryavasyati — paryantabhittirūpatvāt,* A reads *paryavasitiparyantabhittirūpatvāt,* which, in my opinion, is the correct reading (*paryavasiti = viśrānti*).
173	2	For *saṃrambhecchaiveśanāntā,* the correct reading is probably *saṃrambha icchaiveśanāntā.*
173	5	Put a daṇḍa after *iti.*

p.	l.	
173	7	Who has been the grammarian Puṣpadanta here quoted is not easy to say. A grammarian of this name is quoted in the NM. On him see the note by J. G. Gosh, Puṣpadanta and the Mahimnastava, ABORI, XIX, 86-7.
174	last but one line	For *A Ā I Ī iti ca,* read *A Ā I Ī iti E.*
175	4-5	The sentence *chandogānāṃ sātyamugrirāṇāyaṇīyā,* etc., is a quotation from Patañjali, 1, 1, 47.
175	8-9	For *ekāraukārayor aikāraukārāpekṣayā,* the correct reading should be in my opinion *ekāraukārayor ekāraukārāpekṣayā.*
175	10-12	Remove the hyphen after *mantavyam* and for *aya ekāra, ava okārābhiprāyeṇāivam — ' E O ' iti bījam sthitam,* read: *ardhaikārdhaukārābhiprāyeṇa | evam E iti bījaṃ sthitam |*
175	12	For *tathā śabalībhūtam* read *tathāśabalībhūtam.*
175	13	Remove with A the *ca* after *tathaiva* and for *anavasat* read (A) *anuvasat.*
175	14	Put a daṇḍa after *E.*
175	15	Put a daṇḍa after the first *O* and another daṇḍa after *AU.*
176	6	Put a daṇḍa after *AM iti.*
176	8-9	Remove the comma after *°bhāvāt.* For *ṣaḍardhaśāstre nirūpitam,* A reads *ṣaḍardhaśāstreṣu varṇitam.* Equally good.
176	10	The pāda *triśūlena cathurtakam* is a quotation from MV, IV, 25.
176	11-12	Remove the comma after *°śeṣataiva* and put a daṇḍa after *sarvasya.*
176	13	For *vedanāmātrāviśeṣam,* the correct reading is, according to my opinion, *vedanāmātrāvaśeṣam.*
177	4	Put a daṇḍa after *anupraviṣṭam.*
177	last line	Put a daṇḍa after *uktāḥ.*
178	1	The stanza *sunirbharatarāhlāda°* is not to be found in the printed text of the SD, as indicated by AG.
178	4	The stanza *tasyāpi śaktir mṛtpiṇḍa°* is to be found in SD, VII, śl. 28. For *viśvarūpatām | gatā,* we read in the printed text *viśvatāṃ gatā |*
178	7	The verse *ekam eva hi tattattvam* is not to be found in the printed edition of the SD.

p.	l.	
178	10	For *nirṇītamr*, read obviously *nirṇītam*. For *ayam evoktakramaḥ*, A reads *ayam evam uktakramaḥ*.
178-9	12 seq.	The two stanzas *sa yadāste cidāhlāda°* are a quotation from SD, I, 3-4.
179	3-4	For *tathā ghaṭam* « *ghaṭādigrahakāle 'pi ghaṭaṃ jānāti yāvasā*, one should read *tathā* « . . . . *ghaṭaṃ jānāti yāvasā* | », without the first pāda of this stanza, which is, as the following one, a quotation from SD, I, 24-25. For *yāvasā* (*avasā* = *adhyavasāya*), the printed text of the SD has *sā kriyā*.
180	1-4	The two stanza *yata icchati taj jñātum* and *tatkarmanirvṛtiprāptir* are respectively a quotation from SD, I, 19 and 17.
181	4	The verse, *puruṣe ṣoḍaśakale*, is also quoted by Bhartṛhari, in his own commentary on VP, I, 143 (ed. of Lahore, p. 129).
181	5	Put a daṇḍa after *iti*.
182	4	The source of the stanza *sa visargo mahādevi* is untraced. According to Kṣemarāja the source of the second verse, *guruvaktraṃ tad evoktam*, is the MV (SS, 60), but it is not to be found in the printed text of this work.
182	10	For *raśau* read *rasau*.
183	1	Put a daṇḍa after *tapavargayor*, remove the comma after *ghanatā* and read *bodhasyā°* for *abhodhasyā°*.
184	2	For *°saṃhṛti iḍā°*, read *°saṃhṛtīḍā°*.
184	4	A omits *nirdiṣṭā*.
184	5	For the word *khaṇḍacakra*, cf. Jayaratha, ad TA, I, 154.
184	7	The source of the verse *māyopari mahāmāyā* is untraced.
184	last but one line	For *°karaṇāny api*, one expects here *°karaṇādy api*. Remove the comma after *eva*.
185	3	The editorial note No. 2, is to be removed. The meaning of *tathārūpatayā* is *satyatvena*, *vastvanusāreṇa*, etc. (in contrast with the following *viparyayena saṃśayenāpi vā*), and not, as we read in the note, *saṃjalparūpatayā*.
186	2	For *tathā samucita°*, read *tathāsamucita°*.
186	3	A gives *abhedāyogāt* for *bhedāyogāt*, which is the correct reading. Before *antarhita°* put a daṇḍa.

p.	l.	
186	7	For *pariśīlayatāṃ saṃvidaṃ*, read with A *pariśīlayata tāṃ saṃvidam*.
188	5	Remove the comma after *iti*.
188	6	Read with A *°nirviṣṭa°* for *°nirviśiṣṭa°*.
190	1	The source of the verse *nirodhinīm anuprāptaḥ* is untraced. A similar verse is to be found in SvT, IV, 238.
190	9	Remove the quotation mark before *āntara* and after *mantra*.
190	13	For *prāṇabhīryādi°*, read *prāṇabheryādi°*.
190	15	*Sarvabhūtarutajñānam* is a reference to YS, III, 17.
190-1	last line	Remove the quotation mark before *śabdārtha°* and after *°paralābhaḥ*. The words *śabdārtha°* etc. are not a quotation but a paraphrasis of YS, III, 17.
191	3	For *°kūjitajñānāya*, A gives *kūjitādau*. Equally good.
191	4	After *varṇānām eva* one expects a *ca*.
191	5	For *yuktyā ta eva*, read *yuktyāta eva* (*ata eva*).
191	6	For *bhīryādi°*, read *bheryādi°*.
192	4-5	Put a daṇḍa after *ṛvarṇaraśabdayoḥ*.
193	34	For *vā māyīyā°*, read obviously *vāmāyīya°*.
193	5	Remove the comma after *bhajate*.
193	6	For *avikalpā*, A reads *avikalpikā*. Equally good. The reading of A, *tac ca*, is, in my opinion, better than the *tataś ca* in the printed text.
193	6-7	For *paramamantramahā°*, read with A *paramamantramahaḥ*.
193	11	For *tatpramādotthaḥ*, read with A *tatprasādotthaḥ*.
194	5	Read with A *atra ca sphuṭam* for *atra sphuṭam*.
194	6-7	Put a daṇḍa after *āpanne* and remove the comma after *°parāmarśaḥ*.
195	7	The source of the stanza *paśyaty anyac chṛṇoty anyat*, is unknown to me. Should one in the fourth pāda read *tatrāsaṃketikī sthitiḥ* for *tatra saṃketikī sthitiḥ*?
195	9	Put a daṇḍa after *iti*.
195	10	The verse *mano 'py anyatra nikṣiptaṃ* is a quotation from SvT, VII, 58.
195	13	For *sattathāvidha°* read with A *satatatathāvidha°*.
195	14	Put a comma after *prasarad eva*.

p.	l.	
195	last line	Remove the comma after *prasarāt.*
196	2	For °*svarūpadhāraṇā,* read with A and G °*svarūpadvāreṇa,* remove the hyphen before *anuttarapade,* and put a comma after *saṃkrāmāt.*
196	4	For °*upādānā*°, A reads °*upadhānā*°. Equally good.
197	3	For *sa eva visargaḥ,* A reads *sa eva ca visargaḥ.* Equally good.
198	1-2	For *a h aṃ,* read *ma ha.*
198	5	The verse *prakāśasyātmaviśrāntir* is a quotation from APS, 22.
198	9 seq.	The stanza *viśvatra bhāvapaṭale parijṛmbhamāṇa*° is from a *stotra* of AG himself and is also to be found in BV, I, 298.
198	last line	Put a daṇḍa after *sarvāḍhyaḥ.*
199	3	For *samudāyāyogānte* the correct reading is *samudāyāyogāt* | *te,* etc.
199		The nature of *kāla* is described in TA, VI, and SvT, VII. Cf. also TS, VI.
201	6	The source of the verse *sā tu saptadaśī devī* is unknown to me.
201	14	For *āghrātakaḥ,* read *āghātakaḥ.*
202	2	For *ekadvayādir eva* A gives *ekakadvayādir eva.* Here the sense is not quite clear to me.
202	4	The verse *praṇavordhvārdhamātrāto* is a quotation from SC, 7.
202	last but one line	For *karuṇā*°, read with A *karuṇa*°.
204	6	Remove the quotation marks before *meru*° and put them before *anyathā.* After *nyāyena* there should be a daṇḍa.
206	last but one line	Put a *daṇḍa* after °*caturā.*
207	6	For *tad eva,* A reads *etad eva.* Equally good.
207	8	Put a daṇḍa after *kiṃciccalanam* and remove the comma after *svarūpāc ca.*
208	4	For *tasyaivaṃ kulasyāntaḥ,* read with A *tasyaivākulasyāntaḥ,* and put a daṇḍa after it.
208	5	Put a daṇḍa after *svarāṇām antaḥ.*
208	6	Put a daṇḍa after *katham.*
208	10-11	Put a daṇḍa after *anāditvāt* and another daṇḍa after *tadrūpo.*
208	12	Put a daṇḍa after *tathāpy amūlā.*
209	9	For *siddhisaṅgham ākhyātā, prakaṭākhyātirūpatām,* the text and the punctuation should be: *siddhisaṅgham* | *akhyātā aprakaṭā* | *akhyātirūpatām,* etc.
209	11-12	For °*viparyayaśakti*°, read °*viparyayāśakti*°.
210	1	The stanza *pañca viparyayabhedā* is a quotation from Sāṃkhyakārikā, 47.
210	5	The stanza *svarūpāvāraṇe cāsya* is a quotation from, SpK III, 15.
211	2	The verse *parāmṛtarasāpāyas* is a citation from SpK, III, 14.
211	7	The pāda *sarvaśāstrārthagarbhiṇyai* is a quotation of MV, III, 26.
211	9	The source of the stanza *anayā saṃprabuddhaḥ san* is MV, III, 27.
211	12	For *tair tair,* read *te tair.* The source of this verse is MV, III, 28. It is quoted also in BV, II, 196 and III, 282.
211	13	Put a daṇḍa after *ityādi,* and read *akhyātā* for *ākhyātā'*
212	3	For *svabhāvayogaḥ* A has *svabhāsāyogaḥ.* Equally good.
212	last line	For *samā,* A reads *sā sā.* Equally possible.
213	12	For *śrutyā*°, read with A *drutyā*°.
214	6	For *tu māyīyād,* read with A *tv amāyīyād.*
215	8	For °*vyomno,* read, with A, °*vyomnor.* Sense uncertain.
218	5	A reads *granthāvatāras* for *granthāntarāvatāras,* which is the better reading.
220	13	Text doubtful. For °*nirūpitanararūpāparābhaṭṭārikāsvabhāvaḥ* one expects °*nirūpitaparāparābhaṭṭārikāsvabhāvaḥ.* For °*parābhaṭṭārikāsvabhāvaḥ* A gives °*parāparābhaṭṭārikāsvabhāvaḥ.*
221	2	For *prati ekasya* read *pratyekasya.*
221	3	For °*chivātmakaṃ hṛdayam,* A gives °*chivātmakahṛdayam.* Equally good.
221	6	For °*tmakatāyām* A has °*tmatāyām.*
221	7	For *anapetam* A reads *anapeta*°.
221	9	*'smākamiti* forms a *samāsa* with the following *samucitā*°.
221	10	For *pūrṇatāmayam,* A reads *paripūrṇatāmayam.* Equally good.
221	11	For °*viśleṣā*° A reads °*viśleṣaṇā*°. Equally good.
221	12	After *vyāpakam* A adds *bṛṃhaka*° (for *bṛṃhakam*). Possible.
221	14	For *narādyapekṣayā* A reads *narāparādyapekṣayā,* which is the best reading.

l. p.	
222 3	After *samadhiśerate* put a daṇḍa. For *tarhi* the sense requires *na tarhi* or *na hi*.
222 5	For °*vikalpakalpyāḥ* read with A °*vikalpakalpyaḥ*.
222 10	For °*bharā*, which is the better reading, A gives °*bhavā*.
222 15	Remove the comma after °*nirmathanarūpā*.
222 16	For *kṣobhātmakavisargeṇa* A reads *kṣobhātmakena visargena*. Equally good.
222 19	*Yāmalayoge* is perhaps to be corrected into *yāmalayāge*.
223 2	Separate *ānandendriyaniḥsaraṇadhāma* from the following *trikoṇakandā*°.
223 3	For °*viniviṣṭacittaniveśāt* read with A °*viniviṣṭaṃ cittaniveśāt*, and for the meaning, cf. VBh, p. 58.
223 6	The pāda *vahner viṣasya madhye tu* is a quotation from VBh, 68.
223 7	For *iti* A has *ityādi*. Equally good.
223 13	*Bahiḥ*, necessary for the meaning, is however missing in A.
224 5-6	For *vistarataḥ, ata eva tad dhṛdayam*, which is the correct reading, A reads *vistarato atas tad eva hṛdayam*.
224 6	Put a daṇḍa after *hṛdayam etat*. Now AG goes to explain the expression *tṛtīyaṃ brahma* in sixteen ways, according to the number of the *bīja*-s.
225 4	After *iti*, with which the explanation of the expression *tṛtīyaṃ brahma* at the light of the *bīja* A, is completed, put ‖ 1 ‖, as a mark of the first interpretation.
226 7	After *mantavyam* put, with A, ‖ 2 ‖.
224 last line	For °*lakṣaṇa*°, which is the better reading, A has °*lakṣaṇam*.
225 1	For *bhairavātmanā*, read with A *bhairavātmano*.
225 3	The verse *sarvabhūtastham ātmānam* is a quotation from BhG 360.
225 5	For *saṃhṛtya anusṛtyā* read *saṃhṛtyanusṛtyā*.
225 7	Put a daṇḍa after *brahma*.
225 10	The source of the verse *ṣaṭtriṃśacchodanīyāni* is unknown to me.
226 1	Put a daṇḍa after *ityādi*. The meaning of the expression *prāg apararūpā* is not clear to me. Corrupted text?
226 2	Put a *daṇḍa* before and after *katham*.
226 4	For *sakṛdvibhātam*, which is the correct reading, A has *sakṛdbhātam*.
226 5	For *tatra, yogyānām* read *tatrayogyānām*, in one only *samāsa*.
226 9	Put a comma after *brahma*.
226 10	Put a comma after *catvāriṃśat*. For *yato'ntaram* (*yato'nantaram* A) the correct reading is may be *yutam anantaram*.
226 11	For °*kalātmano*, which is the correct reading, A reads °*kālātmano*.
226 13	After *bodhamayam* put, with A, ‖ 3 ‖.
227 1	Put a comma after *yatra*.
227 2	Remove the dot after *saṃhṛtiḥ*.
227 3	After *tenānvitam* put, with A, ‖ 4 ‖.
227 7	For *tithīśāntena*, which is the correct reading, A has *tithīśānte*.
227 8	For *praruruksutayā*, which is the correct reading, A has *praruruksatā*°.
227 9	After *bharaṇāpekṣaḥ* put, with A, ‖ 5 ‖.
227 11	For *ūkāra*° the sense requires *ukāra*.
227 13	For *yat ata eva*, which is the correct reading, A reads *yadāta eva*.
227 15	After *samanvitam* put, with A, ‖ 6 ‖. Now AG goes to explain the said expression in the light of the four *śūnya-*, *amṛta-*, or *ṣaṇḍhabīja*-s, i. e., Ṛ, Ṝ, Ḷ, and Ḹ 3.
228 2	For *bāhyena* read with A *vāhnena*, and after *tejasānvitam* put ‖ 7 ‖.
228 4	After *evam eva* put ‖ 8 ‖.
228 6	For *samanvitam*, which is the better reading, A has *yutam*.
228 7	For *sahitam* A reads *samitam*. Equally good.
228 8	After *vyomātma* put ‖ 9 ‖.
228 10	After *bhairavātma* there is no need to go to a fresh line.
228 13	For °*pāṣaṇa*° read °*pāṣāṇa*°.
228 last but one line	The source of the verse *bherīkāṃsyaninādo' pi* is unknown to me.
228 last line	After *ityādi* put ‖ 10 ‖. Now AG goes to expound the same expression in the light of the four diphtongues, which, as we have seen, represent the *kriyāśakti* (cf. p. 172).
229 3	For *tadā* A has *yathā*, which, in my opinion, is the correct reading.

p.	l.	
229	7	Put a daṇḍa after *tad akulam*.
229	9	After *anvita* put ‖ 11 ‖.
229	11	Put a daṇḍa after *dīrghībhūtam* and remove the dot after *naḥ*.
229	14	For °*tattvopayogena* A reads °*tattvayogena*. Equally possible.
229	last but one line	The source of the verse *kāmena kāmayet kāmān* is unknown to me. This verse, which is quoted in MVV, I, 280, is also to be found in the *Vāmakeśvarīmata* (KSTS), 4, 34.
230	1	The source of the verse *eokāragataṃ bījam* is unknown to me.
230	2	After *ityādi* put ‖ 12 ‖.
230	4	After °*nupraviṣṭam* put ‖ 13-14 ‖.
230	5	*Bhairavātma* is may be to separate from the following *vedanarūpatayā*.
230	6	After *hṛdayam* put ‖ 15 ‖.
230	12	After *avadhānena* put ‖ 16 ‖.
230	last line	Put a comma after *yutaṃ* and *puryaṣṭakātma*.
231	7	Put a comma after *ākrāmet*.
231	8	Put a comma after *caturdaśa*.
231	last line	For *catvāriṃśadyutam* the sense requires, in my opinion, *catvāriṃśat tadyutam*, which is the reading of A. The text from *īśā* up to *kālās trayaḥ* (p. 232) is very doubtful. If we will obtain the number of 112 the 11 Rudrā are not to be taken into account (14+80+15+3=112).
232	last line	A omits *yasya*, which is however necessary for the sense.
233	1	Put a comma after *tithīśāntam*.
233	2	Put a comma after *tṛtīyam*.
233	3	Put a comma after *bhasma*.
233	4	Put a comma after *ambu*.
233	last but one line	For *saṃsārabījataroḥ* read with A *saṃsārajīrṇataroḥ*.
235	1	Remove the dot after *bhavet*, the comma after *kalpitā*, and put a daṇḍa after *prati ca*.
235	3	For *bahuvidha*° A has *bahuvidhā*, which is in my opinion a better reading.
235	7	The pāda *glānir viluṇṭhikā dehe* is a quotation from SpK, III, 8.
235	12	The verse *vīravrataṃ cābhinanded*, which according to AG himself is a quotation from the Bhargaśikhātantra, is quoted also in TA, VII^{2}, 103.
235	last but one line	The source of the stanzas *ajñānāc chaṅkate mūḍhas* is the *Sarvācāratantra*. These stanzas are quoted also by Jayaratha in TA, VII 2, 106. The source of them, according to Jayaratha, is the Sarvavīra, which probably is only another name for the Sarvācāra.

p.	.	
236	9	The source of the stanza *sarvārthasaṃkarṣaṇasaṃyamasya* is, as AG says, the lost Kramastotra. This stanza is quoted also by Jayaratha in TA, III, 165.
237	3	Text may be corrupted. The sentence *upadeśavyaṅgateti*, etc., is not clear to me.
237	5-8	The passage *guṇā icchādyā*, etc. is in my opinion to be corrected in the following way: *guṇā icchādyā nirṇītāś caturdaśasvarebhyaḥ / okāraaṃkāramadhyagas tithīśāntaḥ / visargas tṛtīyam / brahma ṣahamadhyagam* / The reading accepted in the printed text, i. e., *guṇā icchādyā nirṇītāś caturdaśa, svarebhya okāraaukāramadhyagaḥ*, is, according to my mind, quite nonsensical. The letters to which AG hints are AU, which is between O and AṂ, the *visarga*, and S, which is between Ṣ and H.
237	8	For *vastuto*, which is the correct reading, A gives *vastu*.
237	10	The *vā* after *kriyāyām* is missing in A.
237	11	For *trikarūpam*, which is the best reading, A and G have *trikarūḍham*; K has *trikaṃ rūḍham*.
237	14	For *vikalpo' pi*, which is the correct reading, A has *vikalpe' pi*.
237	last line	For *bhedaparamārthatayā* the sense requires *'bhedaparamārthatayā*.
238	6	For °*vikāsāt* A reads °*vighātāt*, which is the better reading. This stanza of AG is quoted also in VB, III, 155.
238	8	The stanza *sarvo mamāyaṃ vibhava* is a quotation from PK, IV, 1, 12.
239	2	For *satī avarṇabhūmiḥ* read with A *paravarṇabhūmim*. Equally good is also the reading of G, *satyavarṇabhūmim*.
239	5	For *samastaṃ* A gives *samasta*°. Equally good.
239	5-6	Put a daṇḍa after *ullasati*.
239	8	Put a daṇḍa after °*palakṣyam*.
241	1	The verse *padaṃ ādyaṃ pṛthak sarvam* is a quotation from VP, II, 2
241	3	For *śāstreṣu mantra*°, A reads *śāstreṣu putramantra*°. Equally good.

p. l.

241 4 Remove the hyphen after *rūḍham*.

241 8 The source of the stanza *sārṇena tritayaṃ vyāptaṃ* is MV, IV, 25 (for *sārṇena tritayam* and at the following verse *parā vyāptir udāhṛtā*, we read in the printed text *sārṇenāṇḍatrayam* and *parāyā vyāptir iṣyate*).

241 1 The stanzas *śiṣyeṇāpi yadā grāhyā* are a quotation from MV, III, 57-8. At the second verse, for °*jāti*° A reads °*jñāti*°: in the printed text of the MV we read °*śuddhi*°. At the third verse, *bheditā* must be corrected into *bodhitā*, according to the MV.

242 6 The source of the pāda *ekaṃ sṛṣṭimayaṃ bījam* is unknown to me.

242 9 The verse *vāmajaṅghānvito jīvaḥ* is a quotation from MV, III, 54.

242 11 The verse *yathā nyagrodhabījasthaḥ* is PT 24.

242 last line For *nakāratvāt* the sense requires *nakārāt* (A reads *nakārat*), after which remove the comma.

243 3 For *nāpi* A has *na ca*. Equally good.

243 7 For *hṛdayam eva* A reads *hṛdayam eva ca*, and, for *sadyoyoga*°, *sadya eva yoga*°.

243 last line For *samūhātma*° one expects *samūhātmā*. After *paraśaktyekarūpaḥ* put a daṇḍa.

244 2 For °*tirodhānena* A has °*tirodhāne*. Equally good.

244 7 For *asyākārasya yathaitat* A reads *asyākārasya ca yathā caitat* (for *asyākārasya ca / yathā caitat*?). Possible.

245 1 *'pi* missing in A.

245 6 For *mudraṇam* A gives *mudraṇām*. Equally good.

245 10 The sense of the expression *prāganyābhāvāt* is not clear to me.

245 last but one line The source of the *stanza yathecchābhyarthito dhātā* is unknown to me.

246 4 The pāda *kālobhayaparicchinnam* is the third pāda of the verse *saṃrudhya raśmicakraṃ svaṃ*, quoted at p. 35.

246 5 For *prāgbhavata*, A reads *prāgbhāvata*, which is, in my mind, the correct reading.

246 7 The source of the lines *bhūtādyapekṣayā*, etc., which look like a quotation, is unknown to me.

p. l.

246 9 For *akālakalitatvam eva vastutattvam*, which is, in my opinion, the better reading, A reads *akālakalitam eva tattvam*.

246 12 The source of the verses *kiṃ ca jāgrati kasmiṃścid* is unknown to me.

247 2 For *kalanam*, which is in my opinion the better reading, A and G have *kalānām*.

247 8 *Svāntargatā* should go into one word with the following *iṣyamāṇavastuna*.

247 10 After *eti* the sense requires a daṇḍa. In my opinion, *tajjñānaśakti*° is to be corrected into *tajjñānaśaktir*.

247 12 After *bhakṣaṇam* put a daṇḍa.

247 last but one line After *tathāvidhavaicitryayogāt* (remove the comma!), the text is apparently corrupted; for *aniścitobhayālambanatvam api* (A gives °*lambanatām api*) one expects *aniścitobhayālambane' pi*, or something alike.

248 4 For *ādadhānaḥ* A reads *ādadānaḥ*. Possible.

249 6 For *smaraty api*, which is in my opinion the correct reading, A gives *smarann api*.

249 last but one line Put a daṇḍa after *siddhā eva*.

249 1 Remove the comma after °*rūpatvāt* and the hyphen after *vīrā*.

249 3 *Tat* should go into one word with the following *kādi*°, etc.

250 6 For *akhyātirūpamaṇḍaṃ* read with A *akhyātirūpaṃ maṇḍam*.

250 7 For *aṇḍam*, which, according to my opinion, is in this case the correct reading, A has *maṇḍam*.

250 8 For *etaddhṛdayamaṇḍalo' pi* read *etaddhṛdayam aṇḍalopi*. °*dhṛdayam* is missing in A.

250 12 The source of the verses *darśanaṃ tu parā devī* is unknown to me.

251 1 For *dṛṣṭakāryeṣu* A reads *dṛṣṭakārye*. Equally possible.

251 4-5 The pāda *kulāt parataraṃ trikam* is quoted also at p. 163, l. 6.

251 10 A reads *maṇḍale* for *maṇḍalam* in the printed text, which is the better reading.

251 last but one line For *śarīra*° A has *śārīra*°, which is a better reading (cf. p. 154, last but one l.).

252 1 Remove the hyphen after *kaścit*.

p. l.	
252 4	*Svayam* should go into one word with the following *gṛhītamantraś ca*.
252 5	For *ity etaddhridayā°*, read with A *ity etad etaddhṛdayā°*.
252 8	Remove the quotation marks before and after *hṛdayam iti*.
252 last line	Put a daṇḍa after *°nairapekṣyam*.
253 4-5	For *tataś* (*tac ca* A) *sarvato mantavyaḥ tad āha* (*tad āha* missing in AKG) *sa eva siddhibhāg yogī, sa eva dīkṣitaḥ nityam iti*, the sense requires *tataś ca sarvato mantavyaḥ sa eva siddhibhāk sa eva yogī sa eva dīkṣito nityam iti*.
254 11	For *vidhiḥ — kriyā jñānam*, read with A *vidhiḥ kriyā, jñā jñānam*.
255 11	Remove the hyphen after *anantasya*.
255 12	*Sārṇena* is a quotation from MV, IV, 25.
257 6-7	Remove the hyphen after *yaḥ*. A omits *jñeyaḥ* and *svāyatanaḥ*, which are however necessary for the understanding of the text.
259 2-3	For *°phalāni tiṣṭhanty evam*, it should be read, with A, *°phalādi tiṣṭhatīty evaṃ*. Remove the quotation marks before and after *viśvam idaṃ hṛdayāntaḥ*. *Evam*, in the same line, should go into one word with the following *parijñānam*.
259 5	The stanza *iyam evāmṛtaprāptir* is a quotation from SpK, II, 7.
260 2	Put a comma after *°bhavet*.
260 4-8	The text is doubtful. For *uktam etatsaṃvit°*, A reads *uktakrame tatsaṃvit°*. The reading in the printed text is, in my opinion, the best. L. 5, *°satatoditā* should go into one word with the following *māyīya°*. Ll. 7-8, A reads *kṛtadīkṣāv iti*, for *kṛtadīkṣādāv iti*. The text, that looks like a quotation, is probably corrupted in more than one place. All the corrections, without other MSS, are subject to caution. In the meanwhile, I suggest *°saṃvidanupraviṣṭau*, *°nugṛhītau na*, and, with A, *kṛtadīkṣāv iti*, which are all the three to be referred at *vīro vā yoginī vā*.
260 11	A omits *°sarva°*. Equally good.
260 12	The source of the stanza *manuṣyadeham āsthāya* is unknown to me.
262 11	For *bāhyatayocitarūpāṇi*, A gives *bāhye tathocitarūpaṇi*, which, to my opinion, is a better reading.
262 12	For *paraṃbrahma°*, A gives *parabrahma°*. The correct reading is, according to my mind *paraṃ brahma°* (*param* = *kevalam*).
263 8	Remove the hyphen after *śikhāyā*.
263 10	Remove the comma after *upacaryamāṇāyā* and the hyphen after *bandhanam*.
263 15-6	Remove the hyphen after *bandhanam* and read with A *ātmasātkārā°* for *ātmasākṣātkārā°*.
263 last line	For *tac ca*, read, with A, *tāś ca*.
264 3	Remove the hyphen after *vighnānām*.
264 5	Remove the comma after *°kalaṅkānām* and the hyphen after *śāntiḥ*.
264 7	The source of the stanza *asmadrūpasamāviṣṭaḥ* is SD, I, 1.
264 10	A gives *°dravyātma* for *°dravātma* in the printed text, which is the correct reading.
264 10[1]	A reads *niyantritvāt* and *asaṃkocādhānāc* for the correct *aniyantritatvāt* and *asaṃkocadānāc*, as we read in the printed text.
264 13	The pāda *yatra līnaṃ carācaram* is a quotation from MV, XVIII, 3.
264 last line	Remove the comma after *kalpyamānasya*.
265 2	Remove the hyphen after *sṛṣṭiḥ*.
265 3	Remove the comma after *hṛdayam* and put a daṇḍa after *iti*.
265 5	Put a daṇḍa after *°rūpatvāt*.
265 6	The source of the pāda *sarvabhūtastham ātmānam* is BhG, VI, 29.
265 7	The hyphen after *ityādi* should be a daṇḍa For *saṃpuṭīkaraṇasṛṣṭer*, the sense requires obviously *saṃpuṭīkaraṇaṃ sṛṣṭer*.
265 9	For *na cānavasthe°* read with A *na cāvasthe°* and see for the meaning, p. 143, ll. 9 seq.
265 10	Remove the comma after *rūpam*.
265 13	A omits *ca* after *sarvatra*, which is however to be preserved. For *yadā* read obviously *yad ā* (*ā* is explained with the following *samantāt*).
265 14	Remove the hyphen after *bharaṇam*.
265 16	For *rasasāvayavitvam* read with A *rasāvayavitvam*.

p.	l.	
265	last line	For *tasya nirmeyatvāt* A reads *tasyānirmeyatvāt*, which is equally possible, if we take that *tasya* stays for *anuttarasya*, instead than for *dhyānasya*.
266	2-3	Correct punctuation requires a comma after *āruksat* and the removing of the comma after *eva*.
266	8	For °*nupraveśa*° A has °*nupraveśe*. Equally good.
266	13	The stanza *svātantryāmuktam ātmānam* is a quotation from PK, I, 5, 16.
266	16	Remove the hyphen after *lakṣyate*.
266	last line	Separate *iva* from *ātmānam* and put a daṇḍa after *iva*.
267	2-3	Put a daṇḍa after *vedayet* and delete the comma after *anuttarasattānusāreṇa*.
267	16	For the correct reading *havanād antardāhāt* A reads *havanāntardāhāt*.
268	1	The stanza *svasvarūpaparijñānam* is probably a *parikaraśloka* of Abhinava himself.
268	10	For *aṅgahṛdbheda*°, read with A *aṅgahṛdbhede*.
268	10-1	For *tadrūpaṃ na yujyate*, which is the best reading, A gives *tat tūpayujyate*.
269	8	For °*nirmita*° A has °*vinirmita*°. Equally good.
270	last line	*Budhāḥ*, if the text is correct, is to be understood as a vocative.
271	1	The stanza *rāsabhī vaḍavā vāpi* is to be found, with some variants, also in TA, vol. III, p. 362.
271	6	For *prollased*, A has *prollasad*°. Equally possible.
271	last line	*Citrīkurvanty*, if the text is correct, may be only a participle neuter plural, referring *ἀπὸ κοινοῦ* to *tattvāni, bhuvanābhogāḥ*, etc.
272	2	For *saṃkrāmaḥ*, which is the correct reading, A gives *saṃgrāmaḥ*.
272	6	For *dravāṇām*, which is the correct reading, A has *dravyāṇām*.
272	8	For °*vṛttitā*, A reads °*vṛttatā*. Equally good.
272	11	For °*tridviḥ*°, read with A °*trirdviḥ*°.
272	last but one line	Put a daṇḍa after *nirṇītam* and delete the comma after °*navakāśaḥ*.
273	1	Put a daṇḍa after °*paryantam*.
273	2-3	For *dhārādharāṇi dhatte*, the sense requires °*dhārādharān nidhatte*. Delete the comma after *nidhatte*, and put a daṇḍa after *vaktavyaḥ*.
273	7	The verse *tathāpi citrakarmārtham* is a quotation from SD, VII, 9.
273	9	For °*yatnasyeva tadāpti*°, which is the correct reading, A gives °*yatnasevātadāpti*°.
274	3	For *vikasat*, which is the correct reading, A gives *vikasattā*.
274	5	For *eva dhyāyet*, which is the correct reading, A gives *evāpyāyet*.
274	6-7	For *somarūpam* as we read in the printed text A gives erroneously *kesararūpam*.
275	3	For the correct reading °*vaśagalita*° A gives °*vaśāgalita*°.
275	last but one line	A omits *eva*, which it is however best to preserve.
276	1	Read with A *dvādaśāntāntam* for *dvādaśāntam*.
276	3	For *viśramya* A reads *viśrāmya*. Equally good.
278	8	For °*hṛtam eveti*, which is in my opinion the correct reading, A reads °*hṛtam eti*.

(To be continued)

Raniero Gnoli